

# The Changing of Environmental Approval Administrative Law Perspective



Fitri Nur Aini Prasetyo<sup>a</sup> Abdul Kadir Jaelani<sup>a\*</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Faculty of Law, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Surakarta, Indonesia.

\*corresponding author: [jaelaniabdulkadir@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:jaelaniabdulkadir@staff.uns.ac.id)

## ARTICLE INFO

## ABSTRACT

### Article history

Received: July 25, 2021  
Revised: September 23, 2022  
Accepted: November 17, 2022

### Keywords

Administrative;  
Environmental;  
Permits;

The renaming of environmental permits to environmental agreements is one of the issues highlighted by the Job Creation Law. Environmental approvals were deemed to not meet the licensing requirements of the State Administrative Law, so they could potentially not be challenged in court like environmental permits. This change prompted opposition from various groups. The purpose of this study is to identify the characteristics of environmental approval from the standpoint of State Administrative Law. This is normative law (doctrinal) research with a statutory and a conceptual approach (conceptual approach). Environmental approvals in the Job Creation Law can be classified as permits under State Administrative Law, and environmental approvals are granted to business actors, according to the findings of this study.



This is an open-access article under the [CC-BY 4.0](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) license.



## 1. Introduction

The DPR RI passed Law No. 11 of 2020 on Job Creation on October 5, 2020. (Job Creation Law). Using the omnibus law technique, the Job Creation Law has eliminated and/or modified and merged several applicable laws into a single statute. So that Law Number 32 of 2009 concerning Environmental Protection and Management is one of the affected regulations (UUPPLH).<sup>1</sup> The renaming of environmental permits to environmental approvals is one of the issues highlighted by the Job Creation Act. The Job Creation Law defines environmental approval as a decision on environmental feasibility or a statement of the ability to manage the environment, which has been approved by the central or regional government.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Mahrus Ali and M. Arif Setiawan, 'Penal Proportionality in Environmental Legislation of Indonesia', *Cogent Social Sciences*, 8.1 (2022), 1–13 <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2021.2009167>

<sup>2</sup>Gregory Rose, 'Australian Law to Combat Illegal Logging in Indonesia: A Gossamer Chain for Transnational Enforcement of Environmental Law', *Review of European, Comparative and International Environmental Law*, 26.2 (2017), 128–38 <https://doi.org/10.1111/reel.12206>

Environmental approvals were deemed to not meet the licensing requirements of the State Administrative Law, so they could potentially not be challenged in court like environmental permits. Consequently, this change sparked opposition from various groups.<sup>3</sup>

Permit is a product of administrative law, whereas "approval" is more discretionary on the part of an authority. Thus, changing the definition of "permit" to "approval" has significant legal implications. The loss of administrative authority for communities to issue environmental approvals is one of the actual consequences. Regarding the previous licensing concept, Article 1 Number 35 UUPPLH states, "Environmental Permits are permits granted to anyone who conducts a business and/or activity that requires an Amdal or UKL-UPL in the context of environmental protection and management as a prerequisite for obtaining business and activity permits.<sup>4</sup> Then, Article 1 Number 36 UUPPLH explains that permits for conducting businesses and/or activities are issued by specialized agencies. Based on these provisions, Law No. 32 of 2009 defines licensing as an environmental permit as a prerequisite for obtaining business and/or activity permits. The provisions that follow explain that if the environmental permit is revoked, the business and/or activity permit is also canceled.<sup>5</sup>

The Ciptaker Law has changed the licensing provisions in the UUPPLH, which previously used a license-based approach to a standard and risk-based approach (Risk-Based Approach/RBA) as stipulated in Government Regulation Number 5 of 2021 concerning the Implementation of Risk-Based Business Licensing. Based on these provisions, the issuance of permits is carried out by the Central Government based on the calculation of the value of the level of danger and the value of the potential for harm to aspects of health, safety, environment and/or resource utilization.<sup>6</sup> In addition, the Job Creation Law simplifies the licensing process by integrating environmental permits into Business Licensing. The consequence of this provision is that if the person in charge of a business commits a violation, for

---

<sup>3</sup>Asmah Asmah and Shinta Nurhidayati Salam, 'A Law-Abiding Behaviour of the Indigenous Peoples in Realizing Environmental Law Enforcement in South Sulawesi, Indonesia', *Caspian Journal of Environmental Sciences*, 20.2 (2022), 431–35 <https://doi.org/10.22124/CJES.2022.5592>

<sup>4</sup>Nathalina Naibaho and others, 'Criministrative Law: Developments and Challenges in Indonesia', *Indonesia Law Review*, 11.1 (2021), 1–14 <https://doi.org/10.15742/ilrev.v11n1.647>

<sup>5</sup>Arifin Ma'ruf, 'Legal Aspects of Environment in Indonesia: An Efforts to Prevent Environmental Damage and Pollution', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 1.1 (2021), 2021. <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.24>

<sup>6</sup>Nurfaika Ishak and Romalina Ranaivo Mikea Manitra, 'Constitutional Religious Tolerance in Realizing the Protection of Human Rights in Indonesia', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.1 (2022), 31–44 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.24>

example, in terms of standards and procedures for environmental management, the main permit, namely the Business Permit, will be affected.<sup>7</sup>

Pollution and environmental damage should be minimized with environmental licensing mechanisms. Multiple interpretations of the meaning of environmental agreements will result in the non-functioning of legal products and ultimately thwart achieving Social and Environmental Responsibility goals. There are two enforcements in environmental administrative enforcement: preventive (prevention) and repressive (administrative sanctions).<sup>8</sup> Licensing is a government instrument that can monitor and control all business activities carried out by the community, legal entities (companies), or other businesses. Permits are an instrument of government action as a public authority that allows or disallows an activity that impacts the environment. The government's results of supervision in granting business permits can be followed up by enforcing environmental administrative and criminal laws.<sup>9</sup>

This article will discuss the characteristics of environmental approval in Law no. 11 of 2020 concerning Job Creation as a juridical instrument to prevent environmental pollution and damage. The author will examine the arrangements regarding environmental approvals in the Job Creation Law and its derivative regulations.<sup>10</sup> Further regulations governing environmental approvals are Government Regulation Number 22 of 2021, concerning the Implementation of Environmental Protection and Management and Government Regulation Number 5 of 2021, concerning the Implementation of Risk-Based Business Licensing.

## 2. Research Method

Legal research is a process of finding the truth of coherence that looks at the conformity of existing rules with legal norms, conformity of norms in the form of existing orders and prohibitions with legal principles, and conformity of one's actions with legal norms and principles.<sup>11</sup> This legal research is normative (doctrinal) legal research with a statutory and conceptual approach. This research is prescriptive and applied by examining legal materials (library based), including

---

<sup>7</sup>Fatma Ulfatun Najicha and others, 'The Conceptualization of Environmental Administration Law in Environmental Pollution Control', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.2 (2022), 87–99 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i2.44>

<sup>8</sup>Abdul Kadir Jaelani and Muhammad Jihadul Hayat, 'The Proliferation of Regional Regulation Cancellation in Indonesia', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.2 (2022), 121–38 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i2.38>

<sup>9</sup>Hilaire Tegnan and others, 'Mining Corruption and Environmental Degradation in Indonesia: Critical Legal Issues', *Bestuur*, 9.2 (2021), 90–100 <https://doi.org/10.20961/bestuur.v9i2.55219>

<sup>10</sup>Rian Saputra and Silaas Oghenemaro Emovwodo, 'Indonesia as Legal Welfare State: The Policy of Indonesian National Economic Law', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.1 (2022), 1–13 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.21>

<sup>11</sup>Rian Saputra and others, 'Reform Regulation Of Novum In Criminal Judges In An Effort', *JILS (Journal of Indonesian Legal Studies)*, 6.2 (2021), 437–82 <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.15294/jils.v6i2.51371>

primary and secondary legal materials relevant to the discussion of environmental approval arrangements.<sup>12</sup> Legal material analysis technique using the syllogism method through a deductive mindset. There are 2 (two) premises in a deductive mindset that are useful for building an analysis of legal issues. Namely, the major premise is the applicable legal rules. In this study, the major premise used is all laws and regulations related to environmental approval.<sup>13</sup> While the minor premise, namely legal facts or empirical conditions in implementing the rule of law. Then from the 2 (two) premises, a conclusion is drawn.

### 3. Results and Discussion

Humans are creatures that think and interpret. In a cultural tradition or activity, the context in which we see the object in it (by projection) is the context provided by language, culture, and practice. Interpretation is the main foundation of law and legal practice. Among legal theorists, there is still disagreement regarding the nature of interpretation in law. Some legal theorists claim that interpretation is the foundation for law. The existence of various interpretation methods becomes a justification that legal texts or statutory regulations need to be interpreted correctly. Therefore, the potential for differences in interpretation is wide open to interpreters.<sup>14</sup> This difference in interpretation is based on differences in understanding based on each interpreter's subjective thoughts, including historical and social backgrounds. Departing from the interpreter's subjectivity, he must interpret a legal text as an objective reality. He must think and be open-minded and free from prejudice. Scholten explained that law is an open system because it contains legal regulations which are incomplete and impossible to complete. Due to its open nature, it is open to wide interpretation. The system will complement incompleteness or deficiencies in a system with interpretations. Law as a system of coherent legal principles.<sup>15</sup>

Richard Dworkin argues that law is interpretation; there are three main things in a constructive interpretation model. First, interpretation aims to present the objects being interpreted in the light of the best possible interpretation. Second, interpretation is essentially genre-dependent. That is, the process of interpretation needs to be revised. Interpretation is separate from certain social objects or practices. Third, some boundaries determine the limits for possible interpretations

---

<sup>12</sup>Ahmad Siboy and others, 'The Effectiveness of Administrative Efforts in Reducing State Administration Disputes', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.1 (2022), 14–30 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.23>

<sup>13</sup>Rian Saputra, M Zaid, and Silaas Oghenemaro, 'The Court Online Content Moderation : A Constitutional Framework', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.3 (2022), 139–48 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i3.54>

<sup>14</sup>Nadia Astriani, 'Legal Politics of Water Resources Management in Indonesia: Environmental Perspective', *Mimbar Hukum - Fakultas Hukum Universitas Gadjah Mada*, 30.1 (2018), 185 <https://doi.org/10.22146/jmh.28664>

<sup>15</sup>Adriaan Bedner, 'Consequences of Decentralization: Environmental Impact Assessment and Water Pollution Control in Indonesia', *Law and Policy*, 32.1 (2010), 38–60 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9930.2009.00313.x>

of a particular object. Based on these three main points, the authors interpret environmental agreements with constructive interpretation model parameters to determine the characteristics of environmental agreements as a juridical instrument for controlling environmental pollution and damage.<sup>16</sup>

### *Simplification of Business Licensing*

The background to the simplification of licensing in the Job Creation Law is the difficulty faced by business actors in starting a business in Indonesia, which is obtaining permits to do business. Business actors are faced with convoluted business licensing procedures, the many types and number of permits that must be owned, requires a long time to process permits, as well as high costs to start and run a business in Indonesia.<sup>17</sup> This condition is exacerbated by the low quality and consistency of regulations and rampant corruption, which results in high costs for obtaining business licenses. Therefore, the simplification of permits that previously existed, such as space utilization permits, environmental permits, and building permits, was integrated into one regime called "business permits" to provide legality to business actors to start and run their businesses and/or activities. In order to identify the meaning of environmental approval in the Job Creation Law, interpretation is needed, which aims to present the objects being interpreted in the light of the best possible interpretation. Theoretically, the term permit often equates with government approval/state administrative will. J. B. J. M. ten Berge divided the meaning of permits into a broad and narrow sense.<sup>18</sup>

"Permit in a broad sense (*verguning*) means an agreement from the authorities based on a law which in certain circumstances deviates from the provisions or prohibitions of statutory regulations. By granting permission, the authorities have allowed individuals to perform certain actions that are actually prohibited. This concerns the approval of an act which in the public interest requires special supervision over it. Meanwhile, permission in the narrow sense is an act that is prohibited, unless it is permitted, so that in the provisions related to permission, certain limits can be carefully given for each case. In addition to giving permission in very special circumstances, but so that permitted actions are carried out in a

---

<sup>16</sup>Rian Saputra, 'Development of Creative Industries as Regional Leaders in National Tourism Efforts Based on Geographical Indications', *Jurnal Bestuur Bestuur*, 8.2 (2020), 121–28 <https://doi.org/10.20961/bestuur.43139>

<sup>17</sup>Andry Harijanto, Siti Hatikasari, and Juliet Musabula, 'The Model of Legal Protection for Children Victims of Domestic Violence Based on Justice Elimination of Violence Against Women . Indonesia Has Ratified the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women ( Conve', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.2 (2022), 100–112 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i2.33>

<sup>18</sup>Ni'matul Huda, Dodik Setiawan Nur Heriyanto, and Allan Fatchan Gani Wardhana, 'The Urgency of the Constitutional Preview of Law on the Ratification of International Treaty by the Constitutional Court in Indonesia', *Heliyon*, 7.9 (2021), e07886 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e07886>

certain way (listed in the provisions)".<sup>19</sup> In the Academic Paper on the Job Creation Bill, it explains the reasons for changing the environmental permit to an environmental agreement because of legal politics in the drafting of the Job Creation Bill, adjusting the nomenclature of permits contained in each law with a general formulation, thus providing the government flexibility in anticipating societal and global dynamics.

The adjustment of the licensing nomenclature to provide ease of doing business, environmental approval is part of the basic requirements for business licensing so that it can be equated with a permit. Article 22 of the Job Creation Law has also defined environmental approval, namely a decision on environmental feasibility or a statement of ability to manage the environment that has received approval from the central government or regional government. Based on this understanding, one form of environmental approval is a decision on the feasibility of life.<sup>20</sup> Regarding environmental approval as a decision, Philipus M. Hadjon classifies permits in administrative law as state administrative decisions to determine prohibitions and command provisions.<sup>21</sup>

According to him, in principle, the law prohibits certain or interconnected actions. Such a ban is not meant to be absolute, but to act and control the community, licensing instruments are used, particularly by linking regulations related to permits.<sup>22</sup> In this environmental agreement, individuals/community groups are prohibited from disposing of waste into environmental media unless they have obtained permission or approval from the Government. In order to obtain government permits or approvals, individuals are required to meet various requirements, which usually include compliance with various obligations and standards.<sup>23</sup>

Regarding the prerequisites for decision-making in business licensing, Article 3 PP No. 22 of 2021 explains that Environmental Approval is a prerequisite for issuing Business Permits or Government Approvals. Environmental approval is carried out through the preparation of an Amdal and EIA due diligence or preparation of the UKL-UPL Form and examination of the UKL-UPL Form. The Person in Charge of Business submits the Amdal and RKL-RPL documents through the Environmental document information system to the Minister,

---

<sup>19</sup>Femmy Silaswaty Fariad, Hadi Mahmud, and Suparwi Suparwi, 'Mainstreaming Restorative Justice in Termination of Prosecution in Indonesia', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.1 (2022), 66–77 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.31>

<sup>20</sup>Muhammad Ridwansyah and Asron Orsantinutsakul, 'The Strengthening of Guardian Institutions in Nanggroe Aceh During the Autonomy Era', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.1 (2022), 55–65 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.27>

<sup>21</sup>Leyla D. Karakas, 'Political Rents under Alternative Forms of Judicial Review', *International Review of Law and Economics*, 52 (2017), 86–96 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.irl.2017.08.004>

<sup>22</sup>Saldi Isra and Hilaire Tegnan, 'Legal Syncretism or the Theory of Unity in Diversity as an Alternative to Legal Pluralism in Indonesia', *International Journal of Law and Management*, 63.6 (2021), 553–68 <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJLMA-04-2018-0082>

<sup>23</sup>Suwari Akhmaddhian, 'Discourse on Creating a Special Environmental Court in Indonesia to Resolve Environmental Disputes', *Bestuur*, 8.2 (2020), 129 <https://doi.org/10.20961/bestuur.v8i2.42774>

Governor or Regent/Mayor by their authority. Therefore, Environmental Approval is very important for business actors because Environmental Approval is a prerequisite for issuing Business Permits or Government Approvals.<sup>24</sup>

Having an Amdal or UKL-UPL obligation for those in charge of a business and/or activity shows that using natural resources must be in harmony, harmony and balance with environmental functions. Consequently, economic development policies, plans and/or programs must be imbued with the obligation to preserve the environment to realize the goals of environmentally sustainable development. Thus, efforts to integrate licensing are expected to be able to actualize the principles of sustainable development in order to guarantee the welfare and quality of life of present and future generations. In various countries, the concept of licensing integration has become an agenda to address various environmental externality problems, which are often assumed to be command and control instruments based on an economic approach. Therefore, environmental agreements are important in preventing pollution and environmental damage.<sup>25</sup>

As an instrument that can prevent environmental pollution and damage, the interpretation of environmental agreements is separate from certain social objects or practices. Submission of environmental documents requires the existence of environmental quality standards and approval from the central and/or regional government. In the environmental sector, several environmental law experts place the position of permits with the approval of one of them, Anthony Ogus, as quoted by Andri G Wibisana, that the most effective form of government intervention is prior approval or permits. In this case, Article 47 PP No. 22 of 2021 states that recommendations from the due diligence results will be considered by the Minister, Governor or Regent/Mayor by their authority in establishing an Environmental Feasibility Decree if the planned Business and/or Activity is declared Environmentally feasible.<sup>26</sup> Thus, the Environmental Feasibility Decree stipulated is a form of Environmental Approval and a prerequisite for issuing a Business Permit or Government Approval.<sup>27</sup>

Environmental law is often called applicable because it contains state administrative law provisions. If you look at the provisions of Law No. 32 of 2009, it contains norms of legislation that fall into the field of state administrative law.<sup>28</sup> Therefore, in all aspects, environmental law will always intersect with human

---

<sup>24</sup>Lego Karjoko and others, *The Urgency of Restorative Justice on Medical Dispute Resolution in Indonesia* Lego Karjoko Abstract: Keywords: Abstrak, 2021, XVI <https://doi.org/10.19105/al-lhkam.v16i2.5314>

<sup>25</sup>Lego Karjoko and others, 'Indonesia's Sustainable Development Goals Resolving Waste Problem: Informal to Formal Policy', *International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning*, 17.2 (2022), 649–58 <https://doi.org/10.18280/ijstdp.170230>

<sup>26</sup>Akhmaddhian.

<sup>27</sup>Kathryn Teigen De Master and others, 'Terroir in Transition: Environmental Change in the Wisconsin Artisanal Cheese and New England Oyster Sectors', *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 11.10 (2019) <https://doi.org/10.3390/su11102969>

<sup>28</sup> Ali and Setiawan.

rights, both substantively and administratively. Violation of environmental rights is a problem that is almost a hot topic discussed all the time. How could it not be? The issue of environmental rights is a problem that directly affects the survival of humans as rights holders to accommodate the right to the environment and the rights of the environment itself. UUPPLH has attempted to elevate individual and social rights norms into its articles by adopting (ratifying) the results of international meetings, exploring community environmental awareness themselves or through jurisprudence. Despite these efforts, sometimes rights are still being violated (including environmental rights), particularly regarding community rights.<sup>29</sup>

The developments in government administration based on Article 87 of Law no. 30 of 2014 concerning Government Administration. In that case, it can be seen that there is an expansion of the meaning of government administration decisions (state administration) which originally only included a structural approach; now it has become a functional approach in determining state administrative decisions that can be used as objects of lawsuits in the State Administrative Court (PTUN). Functionally, there are similarities between permits and approvals in the environmental sector as state administrative decisions. When referring to jurisprudence in the Supreme Court Decision Number 580 K/TUN/2018, the object of the lawsuit, in this case, is the Barru Regent's Decree regarding the Environmental feasibility of the Industrial Development Plan Cement by PT.<sup>30</sup> Conch Barru Cement Indonesia. In this case, the procedure for a business permit was flawed because it needed to be accompanied by environmental documents in the form of an EIA so that the community challenged the decision regarding environmental feasibility.

The Supreme Court believes that the objects of TUN disputes in Environmental cases are not limited to decisions of TUN bodies or officials as referred to in Article 93 paragraph 1 of the UUPPLH, but all State Administrative Courts that concern the Environment to lawsuits to defend the interests of the Environment so that pollution does not occur and/or damage. Thus the panel of judges considers written approval from the competent government official to be equated with a permit. This means that the agreement, regardless of its form, can be positioned as one of the government's legal action instruments (*bestuurshandelingen*).<sup>31</sup>

---

<sup>29</sup>Indah Nur Shanty Saleh and Bitu Gadsia Spaltani, 'Environmental Judge Certification in an Effort to Realize the Green Legislation Concept in Indonesia', *Law and Justice*, 6.1 (2021), 1–18 <https://doi.org/10.23917/laj.v6i1.13695>

<sup>30</sup>Adiguna Bagas Waskito Aji and others, 'Social Justice on Environmental Law Enforcement in Indonesia: The Contemporary and Controversial Cases', *The Indonesian Journal of International Clinical Legal Education*, 2.1 (2020), 57–72 <https://doi.org/10.15294/ijicle.v2i1.37324>

<sup>31</sup>Rika Fajrini, 'Environmental Harm and Decriminalization of Traditional Slash-and-Burn Practices in Indonesia', *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy*, 11.1 (2022), 28–43 <https://doi.org/10.5204/ijcsd.2034>

Reza Baihaki explained that environmental approvals are still an *objectum litis* based on the *eiusdem generis* principle approach or interpretation by looking at types and groups, meaning that as long as government administration officials issue environmental approvals, this automatically constitutes an administrative, legal act which broadly can be used as a liability sue in court. Thus, the TUN decision applies the principle of *presumptio justae causa*. If its implementation can create environmental damage, the implementation (permit) can be postponed or even cancelled.<sup>32</sup> The Job Creation Law emphasizes that the Business Permit can be cancelled if a business actor commits a violation.

The provisions above, changing an environmental permit to an environmental agreement does not eliminate the government's administrative and legal action rights. Thus the *ratio legis* of Article 22 of the Ciptaker Law is only intended to facilitate the investment climate. At the same time, the issue of accountability for administrative decisions will return to general regulations regarding government administration and state administrative justice. So that the Job Creation Law still maintains the context of Environmental Approval as a prerequisite for Business Licensing. Simplifying the business licensing system does not mean simplifying environmental impacts and environmental feasibility studies that must be fulfilled to manage these impacts. This is, of course, in line with the principles of sustainability and sustainability in the UUPPLH, in which every business actor has an obligation and responsibility for his business activities that have an impact on the environment by making efforts to preserve the carrying capacity of the ecosystem and improve the quality of the environment for future generations and each other in one generation.<sup>33</sup>

### ***Risk-Based Business Licensing***

The Job Creation Law, licensing is simplified through a risk-based approach (RBA) in business licensing so that various permits and their supervision are integrated into business licensing. Further provisions regarding risk-based business licensing are regulated in Government Regulation 5 of 2021 concerning the Implementation of Risk-Based Business Licensing. The Central Government implements risk analysis by identifying business activities, assessing the level of danger, assessing potential hazards, determining the level of Risk and rating of business scale, and determining the type of Business Permit. Based on PP No. 5 of 2021, there are 1,702 business activities consisting of 1,349 Standard Classifications

---

<sup>32</sup>Fachruddin Majeri Mangunjaya and Gugah Praharawati, 'Fatwas on Boosting Environmental Conservation in Indonesia', *Religions*, 10.10 (2019), 1–14 <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel10100570>

<sup>33</sup>Giovanni De Gregorio, 'Democratising Online Content Moderation: A Constitutional Framework', *Computer Law and Security Review*, 36 (2020), 105374 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clsr.2019.105374>

for Indonesian Business Fields (KBLI), which have been implemented in the Risk-Based Online Single Submission (OSS) System.<sup>34</sup>

KBLI is a classification of Indonesian economic activities/activities that produce products/outputs, both in the form of goods and services, based on business fields to provide uniformity in concepts, definitions and classifications of business fields in the development and shifts in economic activities in Indonesia. With this classification of business activities, the government will determine the type of business permit. Assessment of the hazard level is carried out on aspects of health, safety, environment, utilization and management of resources. Furthermore, in determining the type of business license, business activities are classified into:<sup>35</sup> a. business activities with a low level of risk; b. business activities with medium-low and medium-high Risk levels; c. business activities with a high level of risk.

In general, applications for permits must follow certain procedures determined by the government as the permitted provider. Because the making and issuance of permits is a government legal action. As a legal action, legislation must grant authority or be based on the principle of legality. Based on Article 22 PP No. 5 of 2021, Business Permits are issued by the Central Government and Regional Governments, which in this case, are carried out by the OSS Institution; OSS Institution on behalf of the minister/head of the institution; the head of the provincial DPMPTSP on behalf of the governor; head of district/city DPMPTSP on behalf of the regent/mayor; KEK Administrator; and the head of the KPBPB Concession Board. To start and carry out business activities, business actors must meet the basic requirements of Business Permits, including suitability for space utilization activities, environmental approvals, building approvals, and certificates of proper function. With the existence of provisions that require the applicant to meet certain conditions determined unilaterally by the government or the licensor to deal with a concrete event. So the procedures and licensing requirements vary depending on the permit type, the purpose, and the licensing agency.<sup>36</sup>

According to Soehino, the conditions for the permit are constitutive and conditional. It is constitutive because it determines a certain action or behaviour that must (first) be fulfilled. While conditional because the assessment only exists and can be seen and assessed after the required action or behaviour occurs. To strengthen the equality between permits and approvals, Alexander Charles Kiss and Dinah Shelton, as cited by Reza Baihaki, position approval as a formal power of government action which in this case can be in the form of permits, licenses and

---

<sup>34</sup>Scott Adam Edwards and Felix Heiduk, 'Hazy Days: Forest Fires and the Politics of Environmental Security in Indonesia', *Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs*, 34.3 (2015), 65–94 <https://doi.org/10.1177/186810341503400303>

<sup>35</sup>Ali and Setiawan.

<sup>36</sup>Svetlana Avdasheva, Svetlana Golovanova, and Yannis Katsoulacos, 'The Role of Judicial Review in Developing Evidentiary Standards: The Example of Market Analysis in Russian Competition Law Enforcement', *International Review of Law and Economics*, 58 (2019), 101–14 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.irle.2019.03.003>

certifications. Thus, the analogy can be used that environmental approval is a genus of environmental permit species. This can be seen from the obligation to fulfil basic requirements as a condition for issuing business licenses.<sup>37</sup>

In addition, Ridwan HR stated that a permit is a juridical instrument in the form of a decree used by the government in dealing with concrete and individual events. Concrete events mean events that occur at a certain time, certain people, certain places and certain legal facts. In order to create jobs, environmental licensing is integrated into business licensing, so it can be assumed that environmental licensing is an administrative instrument. Environmental law is administratively born when a wise decision of the authorities is expressed in the form of a ruling decision (*beschikking*) by the authorities, for example, in licensing procedures, determining environmental quality standards, and procedures for analyzing environmental impacts.<sup>38</sup>

Permits are legal instruments that control the behaviour of people or institutions that are preventive. If referring to Law no. 32 of 2009, environmental instruments aim to prevent pollution and/or damage to the environment consisting of 1) Strategic Environmental, 2) Assessment; 3) Spatial Planning; 4) Environmental Quality Standards; 4) Criteria for Environmental Quality Standards; 5) Environmental Impact Analysis (Amdal); 6) Environmental Management Efforts and Environmental Monitoring Efforts (UKL-UPL); 7) Licensing; 8) Environmental Economic Instruments; 9) Environmental Based Laws and Regulations; 10) Environmental Based Budget; 11) Environmental Risk Analysis; 12) Environmental Audit, and 13) Other instruments according to the needs and/or scientific developments. Environmental instruments in risk-based licensing, one of which is the Environmental Feasibility Decree, are stipulated by the Central Government or Regional Government based on the results of environmental due diligence. The Environmental Feasibility Decree is used as a requirement for the issuance of Business permits or approval from the Central Government or Regional Governments. So that environmental agreements can be equated with permits which are juridical instruments in the form of decisions that allow something that was not previously permitted (constitutive) and which is used by the government to deal with or determine concrete (conditional) events.<sup>39</sup>

Based on the mandatory Requirements for Environmental Approval in Business Licensing, business activities with a low level of risk are in the form of Business Identification Numbers (NIB) which are the identity of business actors as well as

---

<sup>37</sup>Chris Marsden, Trisha Meyer, and Ian Brown, 'Platform Values and Democratic Elections: How Can the Law Regulate Digital Disinformation?', *Computer Law and Security Review*, 36 (2020), 105373 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clsr.2019.105373>

<sup>38</sup>Michael D. Trood, Benjamin L. Spivak, and James R.P. Ogloff, 'A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of the Effects of Judicial Supervision on Recidivism and Well-Being Factors of Criminal Offenders', *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 74.October 2020 (2021), 101796 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcrimjus.2021.101796>

<sup>39</sup>Tegnan and others.

the legality to carry out business activities. For medium-low and medium-high risk levels in the form of NIB and standard certificates. Standard Certificate is the legality to carry out business activities in the form of a statement by Business Actors to meet business standards to carry out business activities provided through the OSS System. Meanwhile, business activities with a high level of risk are in the form of NIB and permits. The license in question is the approval of the Central Government or Regional Government for the implementation of business activities that Business Actors must fulfil before carrying out their business activities.<sup>40</sup>

The higher the potential risk posed by certain business activities, the tighter the control from the Government and the more requirements and inspections that are required. For low-risk activities, permits and inspections are generally unnecessary. Environmental Licensing that uses a risk-based approach can simplify the previous licensing forms and be adapted to certain business activities. The government also uses certain standards to identify the possibility/probability of a risk occurring in business activities and determines the requirements that must be met. The risk-based environmental licensing system is expected to provide regulatory convenience in business activities. Adopting the risk-based approach concept in the permit simplification program assumes that its application is expected to reduce the number of existing permits. Thus, monitoring activities are also expected to be more efficient because supervision resources will only be deployed for high-risk activities. Coupled with the omnibus format, which is expected to overcome hyperregulation problems.<sup>41</sup>

Permits are an important instrument in controlling an activity or business. Some of its functions are described by Sutedi in his book as follows. First, as a regulatory function, permits are useful for ensuring that places and forms of community activities/businesses do not conflict with each other. Second, as a regulatory function, to ensure that permits are implemented according to their designation and that there is no misuse of the designation. In this case, permits are legal instruments owned by the government to regulate and encourage citizens to act by certain concrete goals desired by the government. Third, as a coaching function, the permit shows recognition from the government that the permit holder has met the requirements and competence to carry out the permitted activity/business. Fourth, as a function of development engineering instruments, permits are part of regulations made by the government in order to provide incentives for development. Fifth, as a function of income or a source of state revenue. In the development of environmental law, the principles of prevention and precautionary principles are known. From an administrative law perspective,

---

<sup>40</sup>Taufik Hidayat, Resti Dian, and Suviwat Jenvitchuwong, 'Disharmonization of Supreme Court Regulations in Material Judicial Rights', 2.3 (2022), 149–66. <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.24>

<sup>41</sup>Ridwansyah and Orsantinutsakul.

the unification of the authority to issue environmental permits to one institution will have a positive effect because it will ensure consistency in law enforcement.<sup>42</sup>

### *The Administrative Law Enforcement Against Violations of Environmental Agreements*

Ten Berge, as quoted by Philipus M. Hadjon, stated that the instrument of enforcing the State Administrative Law includes monitoring and enforcing sanctions. Supervision is a preventive step to enforce compliance, while the application of sanctions is a repressive step to enforce compliance.<sup>43</sup> In terms of supervision as a preventive measure to enforce compliance, this can be seen in Article 22 Number 26 of the Job Creation Law which states, "The Central Government or Regional Government in accordance with their authority based on the norms, standards, procedures and criteria set by the central Government are obliged to carry out supervision of the compliance of those in charge of businesses and or activities with Business Permits, or approval from the Central Government or Regional Governments" (Amendment to Article 72 UUPPLH).

As a preventive measure, Article 218 PP No. 5 of 2021 states that there are two types of supervision: routine and incidental. Routine is a scheduled and planned supervision which includes Periodic Reports and Field Inspections. At the same time, incidental is a type of supervision without notification. Supervision of the implementation of environmental agreements expects business actors to exercise self-control and is limited to government instruments, in this case, supervision by permit-giving officials in carrying out command and control. However, at a practical level, it is not easy to expect business actors/activities to control themselves and even supervise their business activities which have the potential to pollute the environment.<sup>44</sup>

Donna C. Rona also stated this by quoting Tomioka's view that it is very difficult to expect business actors/activities to force themselves effectively to obey and comply with norms (values) in environmental protection and management. Therefore regulations and permits are needed to oversee the activity/business. The authority of the Environmental Monitoring Officer (PPLH) is emphasized in Article 494 paragraph (2) PP No. 22 of 2021 states that "In carrying out supervision, the Minister, Governor or Regent/Mayor determines an Environmental Monitoring Officer who is a functional official." PPLH can carry out direct and/or indirect supervision. Supervision is carried out directly by visiting the location of the business and/or activity while indirectly by reviewing

---

<sup>42</sup>Alon Cohen, 'Independent Judicial Review: A Blessing in Disguise', *International Review of Law and Economics*, 37 (2014), 209–20 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.irl.2013.10.006>

<sup>43</sup>Fatma Ulfatun Najicha and others.

<sup>44</sup>André Albuquerque Sant'Anna and Lucas Costa, 'Environmental Regulation and Bail Outs under Weak State Capacity: Deforestation in the Brazilian Amazon', *Ecological Economics*, 186, September 2020 (2021) <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2021.107071>

the report data of the person in charge of the business and/or activity and/or environmental information system.<sup>45</sup>

Furthermore, the application of sanctions as a repressive measure to force compliance. If a violation of the Business Licensing is found during supervision, the Central Government or Regional Government may apply administrative sanctions to the person in charge of the business. Administrative sanctions are applied based on the minutes of supervision and reports on the results of supervision. In administrative sanctions, the target of its application is aimed at actions.<sup>46</sup> This has also been explained in Article 82B of the Job Creation Law, which states that "Any person who due to negligence commits an act that results in exceeding the ambient air quality standard, water quality standard, seawater quality standard, or environmental damage standard criteria that are not by the Licensing Business that is owned will be subject to administrative sanctions. Article 508 PP No. 22 of 2021 states that the administrative sanctions are: a. written warning; b. government coercion; c. administrative fines; d. freezing of Undertaking Licensing; and/or e. revocation of Business Permit.

Suppose those in charge of a business and/or activity are still found to be disobedient. In that case, the Environmental Monitoring Officer will provide recommendations for follow-up actions for administrative, civil and/or criminal law enforcement. Criminal law is an alternative or last resort in a law enforcement effort.<sup>47</sup> So criminal law enforcement in the environmental sector continues to pay attention to the *ultimum remedium* principle. However, its implementation is carried out if administrative sanctions fail to give a deterrent effect to the perpetrators. Carried out after the occurrence of controlled actions, and control from a legal perspective (*rechtmatigheid*) which assesses from a legal aspect.<sup>48</sup>

#### 4. Conclusion

The characteristics of environmental approvals in Law Number 11 of 2020 concerning Job Creation can be categorized as permits from the perspective of State Administrative Law. Based on Article 3 PP No. 22 of 2021, environmental approval has fulfilled the following licensing elements. First, environmental approval must be owned by every business and/or activity that impacts the environment. Second, environmental approval is given to business actors or government agencies. Third, environmental approval is a prerequisite for issuing

---

<sup>45</sup>Laura Liliana Huaranca and others, 'Social Perspectives on Deforestation, Land Use Change, and Economic Development in an Expanding Agricultural Frontier in Northern Argentina', *Ecological Economics*, 165, April (2019), 106424 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2019.106424>

<sup>46</sup>Subhan Ullah and Asma Nasim, 'Do Firm-Level Sustainability Targets Drive Environmental Innovation? Insights from BRICS Economies', *Journal of Environmental Management*, 294, May (2021), 112754 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2021.112754>

<sup>47</sup>Jovanka Denkova, 'Environmental Education in Macedonian Literature for Children and Juvenils as a Way of Humanization of Children's Personality', *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 15 (2011), 3158–62 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2011.04.264>

<sup>48</sup>Tegnan and others.

business permits or government approval. Fourth, environmental approval is carried out through preparing an Amdal and EIA feasibility test or preparation of the UKL-UPL form and examination of the UKL-UPL form. Fifth, the environmental approval ends with the end of the business permit or government approval. Thus, this environmental agreement has a concrete, individual and final nature so that it can be equated with a permit.

## References

- Aji, Adiguna Bagas Waskito, Puji Wiyatno, Ridwan Arifin, and Ubaidillah Kamal, 'Social Justice on Environmental Law Enforcement in Indonesia: The Contemporary and Controversial Cases', *The Indonesian Journal of International Clinical Legal Education*, 2.1 (2020), 57–72 <https://doi.org/10.15294/ijicle.v2i1.37324>
- Akhmaddhian, Suwari, 'Discourse on Creating a Special Environmental Court in Indonesia to Resolve Environmental Disputes', *Bestuur*, 8.2 (2020), 129 <https://doi.org/10.20961/bestuur.v8i2.42774>
- Albuquerque Sant'Anna, André, and Lucas Costa, 'Environmental Regulation and Bail Outs under Weak State Capacity: Deforestation in the Brazilian Amazon', *Ecological Economics*, 186. September 2020 (2021) <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2021.107071>
- Ali, Mahrus, and M. Arif Setiawan, 'Penal Proportionality in Environmental Legislation of Indonesia', *Cogent Social Sciences*, 8.1 (2022), 1–13 <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2021.2009167>
- Arifin Ma'ruf, 'Legal Aspects of Environment in Indonesia: An Efforts to Prevent Environmental Damage and Pollution', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 1.1 (2021), 2021 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.24>
- Asmah, Asmah, and Shinta Nurhidayati Salam, 'A Law-Abiding Behaviour of the Indigenous Peoples in Realizing Environmental Law Enforcement in South Sulawesi , Indonesia', *Caspian Journal of Environmental Sciences*, 20.2 (2022), 431–35 <https://doi.org/10.22124/CJES.2022.5592>
- Astriani, Nadia, 'Legal Politics of Water Resources Management in Indonesia: Environmental Perspective', *Mimbar Hukum - Fakultas Hukum Universitas Gadjah Mada*, 30.1 (2018), 185 <https://doi.org/10.22146/jmh.28664>
- Avdasheva, Svetlana, Svetlana Golovanova, and Yannis Katsoulacos, 'The Role of Judicial Review in Developing Evidentiary Standards: The Example of Market Analysis in Russian Competition Law Enforcement', *International Review of Law and Economics*, 58 (2019), 101–14 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.irle.2019.03.003>
- Bedner, Adriaan, 'Consequences of Decentralization: Environmental Impact Assessment and Water Pollution Control in Indonesia', *Law and Policy*, 32.1 (2010), 38–60 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9930.2009.00313.x>
- Cohen, Alon, 'Independent Judicial Review: A Blessing in Disguise', *International Review of Law and Economics*, 37 (2014), 209–20

- <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.irle.2013.10.006>  
Denkova, Jovanka, 'Environmental Education in Macedonian Literature for Children and Juvenils as a Way of Humanization of Children's Personality', *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 15 (2011), 3158–62  
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2011.04.264>
- Edwards, Scott Adam, and Felix Heiduk, 'Hazy Days: Forest Fires and the Politics of Environmental Security in Indonesia', *Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs*, 34.3 (2015), 65–94 <https://doi.org/10.1177/186810341503400303>
- Fajrini, Rika, 'Environmental Harm and Decriminalization of Traditional Slash-and-Burn Practices in Indonesia', *International Journal for Crime, Justice and Social Democracy*, 11.1 (2022), 28–43 <https://doi.org/10.5204/ijcsd.2034>
- Fatma Ulfatun Najicha, Lego Karjoko, I Gusti Ayu Ketut Rachmi Handayania, Rosita Chandrakirana, and Dian Furqani Tenrilawa, 'The Conceptualization of Environmental Administration Law in Environmental Pollution Control', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.2 (2022), 87–99  
<https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i2.44>
- De Gregorio, Giovanni, 'Democratising Online Content Moderation: A Constitutional Framework', *Computer Law and Security Review*, 36 (2020), 105374 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clsr.2019.105374>
- Hariyanto, Andry, Siti Hatikasari, and Juliet Musabula, 'The Model of Legal Protection for Children Victims of Domestic Violence Based on Justice Elimination of Violence Against Women . 2 Indonesia Has Ratified the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women ( Conve', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.2 (2022), 100–112 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i2.33>
- Hidayat, Taufik, Resti Dian, and Suviwat Jenvitchuwong, 'Disharmonization of Supreme Court Regulations in Material Judicial Rights', 2.3 (2022), 149–66  
<https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.24>
- Huaranca, Laura Liliana, Martín Alejandro Iribarnegaray, Federico Albesa, José Norberto Volante, Christian Brannstrom, and L. Seghezzeo, 'Social Perspectives on Deforestation, Land Use Change, and Economic Development in an Expanding Agricultural Frontier in Northern Argentina', *Ecological Economics*, 165.April (2019), 106424  
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2019.106424>
- Huda, Ni'matul, Dodik Setiawan Nur Heriyanto, and Allan Fatchan Gani Wardhana, 'The Urgency of the Constitutional Preview of Law on the Ratification of International Treaty by the Constitutional Court in Indonesia', *Heliyon*, 7.9 (2021), e07886 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e07886>
- Ishak, Nurfaika, and Romalina Ranaivo Mikea Manitra, 'Constitutional Religious Tolerance in Realizing the Protection of Human Rights in Indonesia', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.1 (2022), 31–44  
<https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.24>
- Isra, Saldi, and Hilaire Tegnan, 'Legal Syncretism or the Theory of Unity in

- Diversity as an Alternative to Legal Pluralism in Indonesia', *International Journal of Law and Management*, 63.6 (2021), 553–68  
<https://doi.org/10.1108/IJLMA-04-2018-0082>
- Jaelani, Abdul Kadir, and Muhammad Jihadul Hayat, 'The Proliferation of Regional Regulation Cancellation in Indonesia', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.2 (2022), 121–38  
<https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i2.38>
- Karakas, Leyla D., 'Political Rents under Alternative Forms of Judicial Review', *International Review of Law and Economics*, 52 (2017), 86–96  
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.irl.2017.08.004>
- Karjoko, Lego, I Gusti Ayu Ketut Rachmi Handayani, Abdul Kadir Jaelani, Jaco Barkhuizen, and Muhammad Jihadul Hayat, *The Urgency of Restorative Justice on Medical Dispute Resolution in Indonesia* Lego Karjoko Abstract: Keywords: Abstrak, 2021, XVI <https://doi.org/10.19105/al-lhkam.v16i2.5314>
- Karjoko, Lego, I Gusti Ayu Ketut Rachmi Handayani, Abdul Kadir Jaelani, and Muhammad Jihadul Hayat, 'Indonesia's Sustainable Development Goals Resolving Waste Problem: Informal to Formal Policy', *International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning*, 17.2 (2022), 649–58  
<https://doi.org/10.18280/ijstdp.170230>
- Mangunjaya, Fachruddin Majeri, and Gugah Praharawati, 'Fatwas on Boosting Environmental Conservation in Indonesia', *Religions*, 10.10 (2019), 1–14  
<https://doi.org/10.3390/rel10100570>
- Marsden, Chris, Trisha Meyer, and Ian Brown, 'Platform Values and Democratic Elections: How Can the Law Regulate Digital Disinformation?', *Computer Law and Security Review*, 36 (2020), 105373 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clsr.2019.105373>
- De Master, Kathryn Teigen, James LaChance, Sarah Bowen, and Lillian MacNell, 'Terroir in Transition: Environmental Change in the Wisconsin Artisanal Cheese and New England Oyster Sectors', *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 11.10 (2019) <https://doi.org/10.3390/su11102969>
- Naibaho, Nathalina, Harkristuti Harkrisnowo, Suhariyono AR, and Andri Wibisana, 'Criministrative Law: Developments and Challenges in Indonesia', *Indonesia Law Review*, 11.1 (2021), 1–14 <https://doi.org/10.15742/ilrev.v11n1.647>
- Rian Saputra and Silaas Oghenemaro Emovwodo, 'Indonesia as Legal Welfare State: The Policy of Indonesian National Economic Law', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.1 (2022), 1–13  
<https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.21>
- Ridwansyah, Muhammad, and Asron Orsantinutsakul, 'The Strengthening of Guardian Institutions in Nanggroe Aceh During the Autonomy Era', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.1 (2022), 55–65  
<https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.27>
- Rose, Gregory, 'Australian Law to Combat Illegal Logging in Indonesia: A Gossamer Chain for Transnational Enforcement of Environmental Law', *Review of European, Comparative and International Environmental Law*, 26.2

- (2017), 128–38 <https://doi.org/10.1111/reel.12206>
- Saputra, Rian, 'Development of Creative Industries as Regional Leaders in National Tourism Efforts Based on Geographical Indications', *Jurnal Bestuur Bestuur*, 8.2 (2020), 121–28 <https://doi.org/10.20961/bestuur.43139>
- Saputra, Rian, Muhammad Khalif Ardi, Pujiyono Pujiyono, Sunny Ummul Firdaus, Universitas Slamet Riyadi, and Universitas Sebelas Maret, 'REFORM REGULATION OF NOVUM IN CRIMINAL JUDGES IN AN EFFORT', *JILS (JOURNAL OF INDONESIAN LEGAL STUDIES)*, 6.2 (2021), 437–82 <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.15294/jils.v6i2.51371>
- Saputra, Rian, M Zaid, and Silaas Oghenemaro, 'The Court Online Content Moderation: A Constitutional Framework', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.3 (2022), 139–48 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i3.54>
- Shanty Saleh, Indah Nur, and Bitu Gadsia Spaltani, 'Environmental Judge Certification in an Effort to Realize the Green Legislation Concept in Indonesia', *Law and Justice*, 6.1 (2021), 1–18 <https://doi.org/10.23917/laj.v6i1.13695>
- Siboy, Ahmad, Sholahuddin Al-Fatih, Virga Dwi Efendi, and Nur Putri Hidayah, 'The Effectiveness of Administrative Efforts in Reducing State Administration Disputes', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.1 (2022), 14–30 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.23>
- Silaswaty Faried, Femmy, Hadi Mahmud, and Suparwi Suparwi, 'Mainstreaming Restorative Justice in Termination of Prosecution in Indonesia', *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System*, 2.1 (2022), 66–77 <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v2i1.31>
- Tegnan, Hilaire, Lego Karjoko, Jaco Barkhuizen, and Anis H Bajrektarevic, 'Mining Corruption and Environmental Degradation in Indonesia: Critical Legal Issues', *Bestuur*, 9.2 (2021), 90–100 <https://doi.org/10.20961/bestuur.v9i2.55219>
- Trood, Michael D., Benjamin L. Spivak, and James R.P. Ogloff, 'A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of the Effects of Judicial Supervision on Recidivism and Well-Being Factors of Criminal Offenders', *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 74.October 2020 (2021), 101796 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcrimjus.2021.101796>
- Ullah, Subhan, and Asma Nasim, 'Do Firm-Level Sustainability Targets Drive Environmental Innovation? Insights from BRICS Economies', *Journal of Environmental Management*, 294.May (2021), 112754 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2021.112754>